

Butler County Board of Elections
Board Meeting Minutes
August 16, 2023

The Butler County Board of Elections met on Wednesday, August 16, 2023, at 1:00 p.m., for a regular meeting. Roll call was taken and present were Member mariann penska, Member Todd Hall, Member Chris Wunnenberg III, Director Nicole Unzicker, Deputy Director Eric Corbin, Early Voting Administrator Stephanie Webb, Ohio Democratic Party Representative Kevin O'Neil, and Poll Worker Administrator/Executive Assistant Melissa Trotta.

Member penska presented Document 1, Bills. Member Hall moved to approve the bills on Document 1; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Member penska asked if there were any comments or questions. Member Hall inquired about Tony's Drain Cleaning in the amount of \$180.00. Deputy Director Corbin stated there was an issue in the men's restroom during early voting that needed to be rectified as soon as possible. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	absent
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.



Regular Board Meeting Bills
Butler County Board of Elections

[Signature]
Chairman

[Signature]
Director

Grand Total \$ 43,251.73

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
520000 - OFFICE SUPPLIES	
ODP BUSINESS Solutio	
OFFICE SUPPLIES	\$57.98
ODP BUSINESS Solutio Total	\$57.98
520000 - OFFICE SUPPLIES Total	
\$57.98	
521000 - POSTAGE	
UNITED STATES POSTAL	
BRM 32-001 BRM PERMIT POSTAGE	\$5,000.00
UNITED STATES POSTAL Total	\$5,000.00
521000 - POSTAGE Total	
\$5,000.00	
524000 - GAS/FUEL/OIL	
VOYAGER FLEET SYSTEM	
JULY FUEL CHARGES	\$122.07
VOYAGER FLEET SYSTEM Total	\$122.07
524000 - GAS/FUEL/OIL Total	
\$122.07	
529000 - OTHER MATERIALS/SUPPLIES	
AMAZON CAPITAL SERVI	
WAREHOUSE SUPPLIES	\$29.99
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$1,686.06
AMAZON CAPITAL SERVI Total	\$1,716.05
DOMINION VOTING SYST	
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$175.28
DOMINION VOTING SYST Total	\$175.28
ERIC A CORBIN	
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$740.51
ERIC A CORBIN Total	\$740.51
FEITIAN TECHNOLOGIES	
50 CARD ENCODERS	\$3,040.00
FEITIAN TECHNOLOGIES Total	\$3,040.00
ITSAVVY	
USB CHARGER ORGANIZER	\$469.20
ITSAVVY Total	\$469.20

Bills

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
JOS BERNING PRINTING	
1200 POLLWORKER MANUALS	\$4,310.00
JOS BERNING PRINTING Total	\$4,310.00
MARIBELLE QUISENBERR	
SECURITY PLANTER SUPPLIES	\$64.87
MARIBELLE QUISENBERR Total	\$64.87
MENARDS	
ELECTION SUPPLIES	\$374.17
MENARDS Total	\$374.17
NOVAVISION INC	
SECURITY SEALS	\$631.10
NOVAVISION INC Total	\$631.10
QUALITY PUBLISHING C	
WATER BILL INSERTS TO RECRUIT PWKERS	\$625.95
QUALITY PUBLISHING C Total	\$625.95
529000 - OTHER MATERIALS/SUPPLIES Total	\$12,147.13

530075 - TECHNOLOGY SUPPORT

DELL MARKETING LP	
ADOBE SUPPORT AND LICENSE	\$316.00
ADOBE RENEWALS	\$1,738.36
DELL MARKETING LP Total	\$2,054.36
ESSVR LLC	
JUNE 2023 VOTER FILE MAINTENANCE	\$7,749.19
TOKENS TECHNOLOGY SUPPORT	\$1,656.00
ESSVR LLC Total	\$9,405.19
530075 - TECHNOLOGY SUPPORT Total	\$11,459.55

530310 - RENTAL - EQUIPMENT

GREAT AMERICA FINANC	
COPIERS 2ND QUARTER LEASE	\$1,337.97
GREAT AMERICA FINANC Total	\$1,337.97
PITNEY BOWES GLOBAL	
POSTAGE EQUIPMENT 3RD QUARTER LEASE	\$1,735.26
PITNEY BOWES GLOBAL Total	\$1,735.26
530310 - RENTAL - EQUIPMENT Total	\$3,073.23

530500 - TRAVEL & TRAIN EXPENSE

CHRIS WUNNENBERG III	
MEALS/ MILEAGES TRAVEL. 6.26.23	\$240.00
CHRIS WUNNENBERG III Total	\$240.00
FRANK W CLOUD	
MEALS/ MILEAGES TRAVEL. 6.26.23	\$304.40
FRANK W CLOUD Total	\$304.40
MARIANN PENSKA	
MEALS/ MILEAGES TRAVEL. 6.26.23	\$304.40
MARIANN PENSKA Total	\$304.40

Bills

Account / Vendor / Description	Amount
MICKEY S SMITH	
MEALS/ MILEAGES TRAVEL. 6.26.23	\$147.20
MICKEY S SMITH Total	\$147.20
NICOLE UNZICKER	
MEALS/ MILEAGES TRAVEL. 6.26.23	\$147.20
NICOLE UNZICKER Total	\$147.20
TODD HALL	
MEALS/ MILEAGES TRAVEL. 6.26.23	\$304.40
TODD HALL Total	\$304.40
530500 - TRAVEL & TRAIN EXPENSE Total	\$1,447.60
536000 - OTHER CONTRACT SVCS	
COX FIRST MEDIA	
DEADLINE TO REGISTER AD	\$350.00
COX FIRST MEDIA Total	\$350.00
ERIC A CORBIN	
TRACKER SERVICE.MAY-JULY	\$24.00
ERIC A CORBIN Total	\$24.00
FEDEX	
JULY CHARGES	\$6.05
FEDEX Total	\$6.05
MILLENNIUM BUSINESS	
FLEX COPIES	\$243.72
MILLENNIUM BUSINESS Total	\$243.72
ROBERT HALF INTERNAT	
TEMP AGENCY	\$9,140.40
ROBERT HALF INTERNAT Total	\$9,140.40
TONYS DRAIN CLEANING	
CLEANED DRAINAGE.7.30.23	\$180.00
TONYS DRAIN CLEANING Total	\$180.00
536000 - OTHER CONTRACT SVCS Total	\$9,944.17
Grand Total	\$43,251.73

Director Unzicker acknowledged receipt of the following directive:

- 2023-12 Instructions Regarding the Review, Examination, and Verification of the Petition Proposing a Constitutional Amendment (The Right to Reproductive Freedom with Protections for Health and Safety Amendment)
- 2023-13 August 8, 2023 Special Election Canvass Instructions

2023-14 Instructions Regarding the Review, Examination, and Verification of the Supplementary Petition Proposing an Initiated Statute (An Act to Control and Regulate Adult Use Cannabis)

2023-15 Instructions Regarding the Review, Examination, and Verification of the Supplemental Part-Petitions Proposing an Initiated Statute (An Act to Control and Regulate Adult Use Cannabis)

Director Unzicker stated there are no advisories or memorandums.

Under New Business, Deputy Director Corbin presented Document 2, Validate and Invalidate Provisional Ballots Cast in the August 8, 2023, Special Election. Deputy Director Corbin stated there are no ballots for board review. There are a total of 805 valid provisional ballots, and 292 invalid provisional ballots. Deputy Director Corbin stated the ballots have been reviewed by bipartisan staff members, Director Unzicker and himself. Member Hall made a motion to approve the 805 valid provisional ballots and to invalidate the 292 invalid ballots; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud absent

Member penska yea

Member Hall yea

Member Wunnenberg yea

All in favor; motion carried.



Provisional Ballots for Board Review
August 8, 2023 Special Election
August 15, 2023

Requirements according to Directive 2023-13

- Printed name
- Valid signature
- Date of birth
- Voter's statement that they have shown photo identification to the election official or completed an affidavit of religious objection
- Current address and cast ballot in correct polling location

Total Provisional Ballots – 1097

Board Discretion

Total - 0

Invalid

Total – 292

- Not Registered – 136
- Identification – 124
- Wrong Precinct – 9
- Signature – 7
- Second Vote – 14
- Date of Birth - 2

Recommended Motion:

Invalidate 292 ballots **not to be** included in the official canvass

Approved: My 8-16-23

Valid

Total – 805

Recommended Motion:

Accept 805 ballots **to be** included in the official canvass

Approved: My 8-16-23

Director Certification

The Director and Deputy Director verified on a bipartisan basis that the provisional ballots cast in the August 8, 2023, Special Election have been reviewed and the eligibility of each ballot is summarized above on this document in accordance with Ohio Secretary of State Directive 2023-13.


Director


Deputy Director

Director Unzicker presented Document 3, Candidates to be Certified to the November 7, 2023, General Election. Director Unzicker stated the candidates have met the statutory requirements to appear on the ballot. Member Hall moved to certify the candidates as listed on Document 3; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

- Chairman Cloud absent
 - Member penska yea
 - Member Hall yea
 - Member Wunnenberg yea
- All in favor; motion carried.



Candidates

The following candidates have met the statutory requirements.

Certified WJ 8-16-23
Admin. Sign & Date

Fairfield City Council Member (1st Ward)

- Leslie Besl

Fairfield City Council Member (3rd Ward)

- Debbie Pennington

Hamilton City Council Member

- Carla J. Fiehrer

Monroe City Council Member

- Keith M. Funk
- Randy Smith
- Candice N. Smith-Bowling

New Miami Village Council

- Thomas L. Huckleby

Seven Mile Village Council

- Sarah White

Lemon Township Fiscal Officer

- Rita Tannreuther

Lemon Township Trustee

- Michael Garver
- Todd Hickman

Madison Township Fiscal Officer

- Kimberly Lapensee

Madison Township Trustee

- Tim Coldiron
- John D. Terrill

Oxford Township Trustee

- W. Glenn Ellerbe, Jr.

Reily Township Fiscal Officer

- Ronald Tilford

Ross Township Trustee (Unexpired term ending 12/31/25)

- David M. Young

Butler County Educational Service Center

- Steve Feldmann

Edgewood City School Board of Education

- Shelly Schmit

Fairfield City School Board of Education

- Scott Clark
- Michael Napier

Hamilton City Board of Education

- Cameron E. Binegar
- ShaQuila Mathews

Lakota Local School Board of Education

- Russ Loges
- Lynda C. O'Connor

Madison Local School Board of Education

- Joseph A. Solomito
- Alex Webb

Middletown City Board of Education

- Charles Cokeley
- Anita Scheibert
- Holly Snow
- Verlena L. Stewart
- Chris Urso

New Miami Local School Board of Education (Full term commencing 1/1/24)

- Daniel W. Marcum
- Tari Jo Slagle

Ross Local School Board of Education

- Krista Rousch

Deputy Director Corbin presented Document 4, Reject Insufficient Candidate Petitions to the the November 7, 2023, General Election. Deputy Director Corbin stated the candidates have failed to meet the statutory requirements to appear on the ballot for the reasons listed. Member Hall moved to reject the candidates to the November 7, 2023, General Election as listed on Document 4; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Member penska asked if there were any comments or questions. Member Hall asked if the candidates had been notified. Deputy Director Corbin stated the candidates would be notified that they were not certified to the ballot and would be given the opportunity to request a reconsideration hearing. Member Wunnenberg clarified that Mr. Elijah Beeler was notified on June 1, 2023, of the deficiencies on the petitions. Deputy Director Corbin confirmed Member Wunnenberg's addition. Director Unzicker explained that the Candidate & Ballot Services department notifies candidates if there is time to withdraw insufficient petitions and file new ones before the filing deadline. Deputy Director Corbin stated the remaining candidates filed closer to the filing deadline and did not have the same opportunity. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	absent
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

Candidates

The following candidates failed to meet the statutory requirements to appear on the ballot for the reasons stated below. Unless indicated otherwise below, the Board hereby rejects these petitions for certification for the ballot.

Rejected MY 8-16-23
Admin. Sign & Date

John P. Centers – Monroe City Council

- The new petition fails to state how many signatures the circulator witnessed as the circulator in the Circulator's Statement as required under R.C. 3501.38(E) in part-petition 4, rendering it and its 18 signatures invalid.
 - Number of valid signatures required - 50
 - Number of signatures submitted - 69
 - Number of valid signatures left due to invalid part-petition - 39

Christina McElfresh – Monroe City Council

- Due to a number of voters printing their signatures and other reasons, the candidate lacks sufficient valid signatures for the petition to be certified for the ballot.
 - Number of valid signatures required - 50
 - Number of signatures submitted - 58
 - Number of valid signatures left due to invalid part-petition - 47

Elijah Beeler – Trenton City Council

- Candidate pulled petitions with CBS staff on February 22, 2023. Among the documents the candidate signed during that meeting, he acknowledged receiving a written copy of rules regarding petitions among which one states: "[a]fter finishing a petition sheet, the circulator must sign and fully complete the circulator's statement ..." On June 1st, the candidate filed the petitions before the Board.
- None of the three part-petitions filed by the candidate have a completed or signed Circulator's Statement as required under R.C. 3501.38(E). This is a statutory requirement for all candidate petitions to be valid.
- Candidate was informed of this deficiency by CBS staff on June 1st by telephone after he left the office after filing and of his right to withdraw consideration of this filing so he may file a new petition before the filing deadline on August 8th. Candidate never filed to withdraw consideration of this petition to file new petitions for the Board's consideration.

Sue Hensley – Village of Millville

- During the midafternoon hours of August 8th, the candidate filed a written withdrawal of consideration of a previous filed petition due to defects in it and filed a new petition. Before accepting the filing, BOE staff gave the candidate a pre-filing checklist typically given to candidates when they pull their petitions,

and the candidate was given time to review their filing with the checklist before filing. After reviewing the checklist and her filing, the candidate indicated she was ready to proceed with filing her withdrawal of the prior petition and filing of a new petition.

- The new petition fails to state which office in the Village of Millville the candidate is seeking (there are at least two possibilities), as well as the date of the election, the entire Nominating Petition section and how many signatures the candidate witnessed as the circulator in the Circulator's Statement as required under R.C. 3501.38(E).

Jewel Hayes Hensley – Village of New Miami Mayor

- BOE staff review found that of the 84 signatures submitted, 20 were invalid because the signer was not registered to vote, another 3 were not registered at the address they listed in the petition, 8 signers live outside of the village, and another 10 had signatures that staff could not sufficiently match with the signatures on file for that voter. As such and for additional reasons, the candidate's petition is invalid for lacking sufficient signatures to qualify for the ballot.
 - Number of valid signatures required - 50
 - Number of signatures submitted - 84
 - Number of valid signatures - 40

Terisa Huckleby Couch – Village of New Miami Council

- BOE staff review found that of the 62 signatures submitted, 18 were invalid because the signer was not registered to vote, another 1 was not registered at the address they listed in the petition, 3 signers live outside of the village, and another 5 had signatures that staff could not sufficiently match with the signatures on file for that voter. As such and for additional reasons, the candidate's petition is invalid for lacking sufficient signatures to qualify for the ballot.
 - Number of valid signatures required - 50
 - Number of signatures submitted - 62
 - Number of valid signatures - 33

Director Unzicker presented Document 5, Sufficient Ballot Issue for the November 7, 2023, General Election. Director Unzicker stated the ballot issues have met the statutory requirements to appear on the ballot. Member Hall moved to certify the ballot issue as listed on Document 5; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud absent
Member penska yea
Member Hall yea
Member Wunnenberg yea

All in favor; motion carried.



November 7, 2023 General Election
Sufficient Ballot Issues

Ballot Issues

All statutory requirements have been satisfied.

Certified MS 8-16-23
Admin. Sign & Date

City of Fairfield – Electric Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 1, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

City of Fairfield – Natural Gas Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 1, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

City of Monroe – Electric Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 1, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

City of Monroe – Natural Gas Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 1, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

City of Trenton – Electric Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 7, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

City of Trenton – Natural Gas Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 7, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Village of Millville – Electric Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 7, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Village of Millville – Natural Gas Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 7, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Lemon Township – Electric Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 1, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Lemon Township – Natural Gas Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 1, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Milford Township – Electric Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 1, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Oxford Township (Unincorporated) – Electric Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 7, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Reily Township – Electric Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 7, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Ross Township (Unincorporated) – Police (Additional) 1.5 mills / 5 years

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 4, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Ross Township (Unincorporated) – Police (Renewal) 3.75 mills / Continuing period of time

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 4, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Ross Township – Electric Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 1, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Ross Township – Natural Gas Aggregation

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 1, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Local Liquor Options

City of Hamilton – Mill One Community Entertainment District

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 3, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

City of Hamilton – Mill Two Community Entertainment District

- Approved by County Prosecutor on August 3, 2023.
- Approved by the Ohio Secretary of State on August 10, 2023.

Member Hall moved to go into Executive Session to discuss personnel according to O.R.C. 121.22(G)(1) at 1:22 p.m.; seconded by Member Wunnenberg. Roll Call:

Chairman Cloud	absent
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

At 2:33 p.m. Member penska stated the Board is back in session.

Under General Updates, Director Unzicker stated Deputy Director Corbin and herself attended a Moving Beyond Confrontation and Managing Team Conflict seminar. Director Unzicker said the seminar was very informative. Director Unzicker suggested the staff attend the seminar if possible.

Director Unzicker updated the Board Members regarding a plan for active threats. Director Unzicker stated Election Service Clerks Katharine Turner and Sherry Hodge have been assigned to the safety team. She said they contacted County Risk & Safety Manager Scott Jividen for assistance plans and resources. Director Unzicker stated the plan will be implemented by the November 7, 2023, General Election.

Member penska requested to contact the Ohio Secretary of State and other counties to see if an emergency plan is available for when a Location Supervisor or Driving Judge services are no longer needed on election day. Member penska stated a plan in the Contingency and Emergency Planning Guide should be in place.

Deputy Director Corbin stated Director Unzicker and himself are looking at different possibilities to receive election equipment more efficiently on election night.

With no further business, Member Wunnenberg moved to adjourn the meeting; seconded by Member Hall. Roll call:

Chairman Cloud	absent
Member penska	yea
Member Hall	yea
Member Wunnenberg	yea

All in favor; motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 2:44 p.m.

Absent

Frank Cloud, Chairman

Nicole Unzicker, Director

Todd Hall, Member

Chris Wunnenberg III, Member

mariann penska, Member